

REMARKS

The issue that remains in this case is that the claims call for a phase change memory element. The item allegedly anticipating this claimed limitation is a select device. A phase change memory element and a select device are not the same thing. For example, the phase change memory element changes phase, whereas the select device does not.

Clearly, in claim 1, line 1, a method of forming "a phase change memory element" is defined. This claim cannot be met by a reference that teaches doing what is claimed, not in a phase change memory element, but, instead, in a select device.

The problem with the rejection is further seen in the rejection of claim 6. There, it calls for a phase change memory element to be read. A select device cannot be read because it does not store any information. Therefore, reading claim 6 onto a select device, as opposed to a memory element, is even more clearly untenable.

The point that was being made in the prior response, supported both by the specification in the present application and supported by the cited application, is that a clear distinction is made between phase change memory elements and select devices for phase change memory cells.

Specifically, in the current rejection on page 4, paragraph 5, it is asserted that Lowrey teaches the claimed element in paragraph 120. But paragraph 120 talks about a select device 120. A select device and a memory element are not the same. Therefore, the assertion that Lowrey teaches "a phase change memory element has a threshold voltage is about 1.2 volts" is apparently a reference to the threshold voltage of the select device 120, in paragraph 120, of the cited reference. The problem is that Lowrey is explicit that it is the select device that has that threshold voltage, not the memory element. What is claimed is the memory element and, thus, the threshold voltage of the select device is of little or no pertinency here.

Therefore, reconsideration is requested.

Respectfully submitted,



Date: August 15, 2007

Timothy N. Trop, Reg. No. 28,994
TROP, PRUNER & HU, P.C.
1616 South Voss Road, Suite 750
Houston, TX 77057-2631
713/468-8880 [Phone]
713/468-8883 [Fax]
Attorneys for Intel Corporation